



ANIMAL WELFARE

National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

Annual Report 1 January to 31 December 2018

National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee
C/- Ministry for Primary Industries
P O Box 2526
Wellington 6140
New Zealand

ISBN No: 978-1-98-859469-9 (online)

June 2019

NAEAC

National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

Contents

Chairperson's Comment	3
Membership	4
Fees	5
Statutory Activities	5
Other Activities	9

Chairperson's Comment



When we use animals, in whatever context, we have the potential to cause harm. The New Zealand Animal Welfare Act 1999 acknowledges that we use animals in a variety of ways. Part 6 of the Act, under which NAEAC operates, provides the specific legislative and regulatory framework that protects animals used in research, testing and teaching (RTT). That framework prohibits some harms, obliges us to mitigate harms, demands that we can justify whatever we do by being satisfied that any benefits from that animal use outweigh any potential harm to the animal(s) and requires us to minimise the number of animals we use.

As my first term on NAEAC comes to an end, I can't help but reflect on how rapidly society's views on animal welfare and the use of animals for RTT continue to evolve. During 2018, NAEAC acknowledged this and endorsed the call from animal advocacy groups for research organisations to support, where appropriate, the rehoming of animals that were no longer required for RTT purposes.

NAEAC members come from diverse backgrounds and have a wide variety of skills that enhance the committee's work. I would like to take this opportunity of acknowledging the input of Terry Fenn and Leasa Carlyon whose appointments have expired. As an educator, Terry provided significant input in a variety of areas during her two terms on NAEAC. While Leasa served only one term, her skills were invaluable, particularly in raising the funding that underpins the Aotearoa New Zealand Three Rs Research Grant.

NAEAC was saddened to learn of the sudden passing of Dr John Schofield on 9 May 2018. In recognition of John's significant contribution to animal welfare in the area of RTT, the rebranded NAEAC Three Rs implementation award was named in his honour. A past member of NAEAC and a longstanding New Zealand Board member of the Australian and New Zealand Council for the Care of Animals in Research and Teaching (ANZCCART) at the time of his death, John will long be remembered as a provocative, insightful and passionate advocate for laboratory animals and animal welfare.

NAEAC relies heavily on excellent secretariat support, which is provided by the Animal Welfare team of the Ministry for Primary Industries (MPI), led by Dr Kate Littin. As Chair I also appreciate the support of the individual committee members' enthusiasm for, and dedication to, their committee roles. Professor Craig Johnson acted as Deputy Chair when I was unavailable. Paula Lemow, Linda Carsons, Nicki Cross, Mark Fisher, Tamara Diesch and Jamie Milnes from MPI, among others, ensure that the committee stays informed and runs smoothly.

A handwritten signature in black ink, which appears to read 'Grant Shackell'.

Grant Shackell
Chair

Membership

Members	Expiry of Appointment
Mr Grant H Shackell Dip Ag, Dip Field Technology, Dip Grad, MSc, Retired scientist (Independent Chairperson)	31.10.18 (Eligible for reappointment)
Ms Leasa C Carlyon JP, Dip Bus, Adviser, Wellington Regional Economic Development Agency; member, Health Practitioners Disciplinary Tribunal (nominated by the Ministry for Women)	31.10.18 (Retiring)
Dr Bronwen J Connor BSc, PhD, Associate Professor, Department of Pharmacology and Clinical Pharmacology, The University of Auckland (nominated by the Ministry for Women)	31.10.18 (Eligible for reappointment)
Dr Arnja R Dale BSc PhD, Chief Scientific Officer, Royal New Zealand Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (nominated by the Royal New Zealand Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals)	31.10.19
Ms Therese (Terry) M Fenn BSc (Hons), Dip Tchg, Learning Area Leader, Science, Onslow College (nominated by the Ministry of Education)	31.10.18 (Retiring)
Dr Craig A Gillies BSc PhD, Scientific Officer (nominated by the Department of Conservation)	31.10.18 (Eligible for reappointment)
Mr Robert P Hazelwood BSc, Animal Services Manager, MSD Animal Health (nominated by Agcarm Inc)	31.10.19
Professor Craig B Johnson BVSc PhD, Cert VA DVA Dip ECVA, Professor of Veterinary Neurophysiology, School of Veterinary Sciences, Massey University (nominated by the New Zealand Veterinary Association)	31.10.19
Dr Malcolm D Tingle BSc (Hons) PhD, Associate Professor, Department of Pharmacology and Clinical Pharmacology, The University of Auckland (nominated by the Health Research Council of New Zealand)	31.10.19

Professor Craig Johnson was elected Deputy Chair for 2018.

Fees

Government policy requires disclosure of fees paid to members of statutory boards and committees. The daily fee paid to committee members during 2018 was \$400 for members and \$550 for the chairperson.

Members are paid the fee for attending meetings, with an allowance for preparation time. Members are also reimbursed for travelling expenses. In addition, the chairperson and, on occasion, other members may be paid additional fees for representing the committee at other meetings or for carrying out significant extra work on the committee's behalf.

The table below lists the fees paid during 2018.

Member	Fees paid during 2018 (gross)
G Shackell	\$12,925.00
A Dale	\$7,400.00
L Carlyon	\$4,960.00
B Connor	\$6,400.00
T Fenn	\$1,200.00
C Gillies*	\$0.00
C Johnson	\$6,400.00
R Hazelwood	\$6,600.00
M Tingle	\$4,000.00

*As a public servant Dr Craig Gillies does not receive meeting fees.

Statutory Activities

Section 63 of the Animal Welfare Act details the statutory functions of NAEAC. This report has been structured so that it addresses each of the functions listed in the Act.

Advice to the Minister on ethical and animal welfare issues arising from RTT

The Associate Minister of Agriculture, Hon Meka Whitiri attended the 15 February 2018 NAEAC meeting and was introduced to members of the committee and MPI officials.

The Minister reiterated the importance of animal welfare to the new government and discussed NAEAC's current priorities, which included: the age at which zebra fish should be considered animals under the Animal Welfare Act 1999; Predator Free 2050 and the implications of gene drive for future research; animal use statistics and new reporting requirements that would impact the number of animals used for the purposes of RTT reported annually to MPI. Changes, brought about by amendments to the Animal Welfare Act in 2015, are viewed positively by NAEAC as they will increase transparency around animal use in this area.

Recommendations to the Minister under section 3(3)

Significant Surgical Procedures (SSP) Regulations

NAEAC continued to provide input on the development of new SSP regulations that relate to RTT.

NAEAC subcommittee members representing the RTT community also attended a workshop hosted by MPI, where stakeholders were asked to identify procedures not covered by specific AEC approval that meet the criteria of an SSP and are currently undertaken by non-veterinarians but were missing from MPI's current list.

Recommendations to the Director-General under section 85 relating to use of non-human hominids

As there were no requests to use non-human hominids for RTT, no recommendations were required in 2018.

Provision of advice and information on the development and review of codes of ethical conduct

NAEAC provides a template and accompanying documentation for use by organisations preparing a code of ethical conduct (CEC).

The majority of applications now follow this guide. Approximately two thirds of applications that are aligned with the template are recommended for approval subject with only minor changes.

Codes that do not align with the template are less likely to be recommended for approval following the first review by NAEAC; often due to their perceived deficiencies. When NAEAC considers that such codes are inadequate, the submitter is advised to redraft the code and is directed to the template for guidance.

Recommendations to the Director-General concerning the approval, amendment, suspension, or revocation of any CEC

NAEAC reviewed nine CECs during 2018. The following codes were reviewed:

- AgResearch Ltd;
- Auckland Zoological Park;
- Landcare Research New Zealand Ltd;
- Lincoln University;
- Massey University;
- NZeno Ltd;
- Schering-Plough Animal Health Ltd;
- Toi Ohomai Institute of Technology; and
- Veterinary Health Solutions.

NAEAC recommended one brief extension to an expiring CEC to allow the new CEC to be redrafted and resubmitted.

No recommendations were made in 2018 to suspend or revoke any CEC.

Recommendations to the Minister concerning the setting of standards and policies for CECs

No recommendations were made in 2018.

Provision of information and advice to animal ethics committees:

NAEAC advisory documents

In response to a decision made in 2017, considerable effort was put into consolidating NAEAC's publications and significantly updating the *Good Practice Guide for the use of animals in research, testing and teaching* into a single reference document. The objective was to prepare a living document that captures changes to regulations, reflects current NAEAC thinking and is updated annually.

The consolidated Guide, due for release early in 2019, covers the use of animals in RTT for the purposes of basic science, medicine, veterinary, animal production and other animal sciences.

In addition, specific requests for advice in 2018 included:

- Preparation of a CEC;
- School Science Fairs;
- International collaboration;
- Compliance;
- Tagging fish as a manipulation;
- Three Rs Awards; and
- Copies of NAEAC public documents.

Code holder and AEC visits

Once a year, NAEAC visits code holders (and other organisations with an agreement to use their CEC), meets their AECs and views research facilities in a regional location. In 2018 those visits were made in the Christchurch area and included:

- Landcare Research;
- Zero Invasive Predators;
- Lincoln University;
- University of Canterbury; and
- University of Otago, Christchurch campus.

AEC attendance

Where and when possible, NAEAC members also attend AEC meetings in their area in an observer's role.

AEC newsletters

Three newsletters from the Chair were distributed during 2018. These included advice and comment on a variety of topics that had been identified during the year.

AECs workshop

Since 2003, NAEAC has hosted a biennial workshop for AEC members.

Members of AECs from around the country have the opportunity to learn, to network and to raise and discuss the many questions that arise when they consider applications to manipulate animals for the purposes of RTT.

For the 2018 workshop, NAEAC chose to emphasise compliance and process.

The workshop consisted of a combination of keynote addresses, short presentations and breakout discussions.

The two keynote speakers covered animal welfare in emergency response and NAEAC's 5-year

Strategic Plan. MPI staff spoke to delegates on non-compliance and the proposed new SSP Regulations.

NAEAC speakers described the committee's revised publications (including the Good Practice Guide and a CEC template) and introduced the ARRIVE guidelines, which were developed in consultation with the scientific community as part of an NC3Rs (UK National Centre for the Replacement Refinement & Reduction of Animals in Research) initiative to improve the standard of reporting of research using animals.

The delegates were assigned to groups relating to their position on their AEC for two workshop sessions on consensus versus majority voting and considering real non-compliance scenarios.

Feedback from delegates was consistently positive and AEC members valued the opportunity to talk with others who fill the same role on their respective committees.

Recommendations for approval by the Director-General of persons suitable for appointment as accredited reviewers:

No recommendations were required in 2018.

Consideration of the reports of independent reviews of code holders and AECs

Independent reviews are conducted to assess an organisation's compliance with its expiring code.

When an application for approval of a CEC is made by an organisation with an expiring code, copies of the independent reviewer's report on compliance with the expiring code are circulated with the new CEC application.

In addition, any recommendations made by the reviewer regarding changes in the new CEC application, and the code holders reply to those recommendations, were also made available to NAEAC.

This documentation was supplied for all new CEC applications to replace an expiring code in 2018.

Recommendations to the Minister under section 118(3) (Power of the Minister to approve research or testing)

No recommendations were made in 2018.

Other Activities

NAEAC Strategy 2019-2023

During 2018 NAEAC developed a 5-year Strategic Plan (see Fig 1).

The strategy addresses NAEAC's vision to provide world-class leadership that underpins the ethical use of animals for RTT in New Zealand. The base premise is that transparency at all levels in the use of animals for RTT is encouraged and facilitated.

Four work streams were identified that meet NAEAC's key objectives:

- balanced public discussion;
- well-informed regulators;
- use of animals in RTT is appropriate and justified; and
- New Zealand's RTT system is trusted.

These each feed into NAEAC's overall aspiration to improve the ethical use and welfare outcomes of animals in RTT.



Fig 1: NAEAC Strategic Plan 2019-2023

NAEAC Service Awards

A NAEAC AEC Service Award was presented to Dr Dave Morgan during the committee's visit to Christchurch in May 2018.

Dave has a high profile in the AEC community, having served on the AEC of Landcare Research and its forerunner organisations for 30 years since the committee was formed in 1988. For 15 years, Dave also served as an MPI-accredited reviewer, assessing compliance by animal research organisations

with the Animal Welfare Act. His reviews were often acknowledged by research organisations as helping to enable improvements to both compliance systems and animal welfare practice. From 2007-2014, Dave also served on NAEAC, and was Deputy Chair during 2010-2014.

As well as his AEC service, Dave developed practical advice for AECs on both monitoring obligations/methods and avoidance of duplication, presented many conference papers on these and other topics, and contributed to developing changes in the legislation that bring the welfare cost of genetically manipulating animals under the AEC's consideration of the cost-benefit comparisons of proposed research.

The Three Rs

The NAEAC Three Rs award was established in 2003 to reward an individual or institution that has made a significant contribution to the implementation of Three Rs principles in New Zealand.

In July 2018 NAEAC announced a significant rebranding of the award that had been offered since 2003. The objective was to raise the profile of the Three Rs Award by increasing its value and prestige significantly enough to encourage targeted Three Rs research. The committee resolved to focus on a biennial cycle and make two awards - an individual award of \$5,000 for practical application of the Three Rs and a grant of \$50,000 towards a research project specifically targeting the Three Rs.

The best way to meet the objective was deemed to be through co-funding. To achieve this, NAEAC approached code holders seeking financial support. The underlying premise being that having organisations that use and care for the animals used for RTT as funding partners for a rebranded Three Rs award, would signal a positive and responsible approach in the way New Zealand manages that use of animals. NAEAC was delighted that AgResearch, ANZCCART, Landcare Research, and Lincoln, Massey, Otago and Victoria Universities generously committed funds to make the vision happen.

The new awards were rebranded as the Aotearoa New Zealand Three Rs Awards. In addition, the implementation award will honour the late John Schofield, who made a huge contribution to the welfare of animals in RTT over many years.

While the primary focus is the researchers and organisations which operate under a CEC, applicants may also include computer software developers, 3D printing facilities and any institutions or companies that have a role in developing or implementing the principles of the Three Rs. Some of these will be associated with code holders, and some may operate independently outside a formal RTT framework.

Aotearoa New Zealand John Schofield Three Rs implementation award

The Massey-SPCA Desexing Clinic was selected as the recipient of the inaugural Aotearoa New Zealand John Schofield Three Rs implementation award and was presented to Dr Kat Littlewood at the November 2018 AECs Workshop in Wellington.

Dr Littlewood, a volunteer veterinarian at the clinic and postgraduate student at the School of Veterinary Science, accepted the award on behalf of the Clinic, which had achieved several successful outcomes since its launch over 12 months previously.

The clinic's successes included a substantial reduction in the number of animals used for clinical training. The desexing programme also had a positive animal welfare impact, reducing the number of unwanted kittens. The clinic has also helped to raise awareness of the Three Rs. The clinic allows veterinary students to gain essential clinical experience while providing a valuable low-cost service to the community.

The clinic was launched in August 2017 by Dr Carolyn Gates, senior lecturer in veterinary

epidemiology, with SPCA Palmerston North and the Massey University Veterinary Teaching Hospital. Over the following year, 56 clinics were held, over 225 students were trained, and over 560 cats were desexed.

Aotearoa New Zealand Three Rs Research Grant

A decision was made to extend the deadline for applications for the Aotearoa New Zealand Three Rs Research Grant Award until mid-April 2019.

Mini-tutorials

NAEAC frequently arranges speakers to present a mini-tutorial at scheduled meetings. Mini-tutorials offer the committee members a chance to upskill in topics of interest at a variety of levels. The tutorials enable NAEAC to address its operational objective of increasing knowledge, experience, understanding and to inform the viewpoints of committee members.

Due to strategic and operational planning sessions in 2018, only one mini-tutorial was scheduled. The committee learned about disaster response to earthquakes during its visit to the University of Otago, Christchurch. Other site visits and workshops enabled members to continue to upskill during the year.

Committee members' presentations and attendance at conferences

During the year individual NAEAC members attended and/or gave presentations at several conferences or workshops. Some members also undertook special interest visits.

These included:

- Zebra fish conference in Sydney, Australia, which focussed on environmental enrichment and what it should look like;
- International Compassionate Conservation Conference in Sydney, Australia;
- ANZCCART Conference in Canberra, Australia;
- Conference on human ethics in Townsville, Australia;
- Fish and pain/halal slaughter/transport conference;
- Gene editing meeting;
- Stem cell conference in Melbourne, Australia;
- 2018 local government conference; and
- Conference on the humaneness of pest control.

NAEAC

National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee